

Clarkston Historic District Commission

Meeting Minutes

September 20th, 2011

Meeting called to order: 7:37

In Attendance: Bihl, Catallo, Luginski Absent: Harrison

No Public Comment

No minutes to approve

No announcements

Mike and Kathy Sabol, 20 Buffalo St, attending for approval of window replacement approval. Sabol stated he read through the material that Dave Bihl had delivered to them a few days prior which included the Secretary of the Interior Standards for Rehabilitation and the associated Guidelines for Windows. He also looked up information at the SHPO website. He wanted to state for the record that he disagreed with a comment made by someone in the audience at the previous meeting where the resident stated that as the house was two houses connected together (duplex) that having differing windows on each side of the house would not be unusual. He did not agree that the comment had any bearing on his application and relayed his position that he was interested in having all the windows in the front of the house and greatly appreciated that type of uniformity.

Luginski asked that Kathy Sabol describe her experience with the HDC application and subsequent approval. She said in 2006 she got the application from Marcy and within a week received a call from a gentleman who asked her if the replacement windows were wood, double hung, whether there were mock muttons and if they looked like the old ones. The gentleman said he could not see any reason the Sabols couldn't proceed and gave a verbal approval over the phone. She continued to say how they love their historic home and intend to maintain and improve it.

Bihl stated that he viewed the previous approval as an error and that the value of the windows themselves was far more significant than the consistency that all new windows would provide. He also stated that the previous approval was a very powerful element of the situation.

Catallo stated that windows and their importance in defining the historic character of a structure have been an increasing in awareness in recent years.

Sabol reiterated that he was bothered by the lack of window consistency. Luginski added that there were ultimately 4 historic windows at issue in the left front of the building and along the (very visible) side of the house. Bihl said again that he valued the historic windows over continuity and asked that he allow his historic windows to be evaluated for their condition and energy efficiency.

Sabol offered to view the project as clustering the new windows together on the left of the house and then allowing the old historic windows to be clustered on the right and side of the house and focus to on repair of those windows in lieu of replacement. Luginski said she liked his idea. Catallo thought the proposed break between new and old was a natural location.

Bihl motioned to grant a CofA to : remove the new/old Store window (2), install old window (1) in its place and install a new window in location 1. This approval is based on the windows fitting in the designated locations. If there are any problems or changes the Sabols are asked to return to the commission. Seconded by Luginski.

All in favor, none opposed.

Suzanne and Edward Doherty, 49 W Washington Street, application for 8 upper story wood windows and an egress window in the basement. Doherty's were approved in 2004 for 10 lower level Anderson wooden windows as replacements for earlier wood replacement windows. They are back now to replace the remaining upper floor, 6 over 6 wood windows. Suzanne stated the egress window is not visible from the street and is a requirement of current building codes if the room were to be used as a bedroom.

Luginski motioned to provide a CofA for the matching Anderson 6 over 6 wood windows and the egress window in the basement. Bihl seconded. All in favor, none opposed

Meeting adjourned: 8:45

*Respectfully Submitted,
Melissa Luginski*